

Goal: 13 Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts

Target: 13.3 Improve education, awareness-raising and human and institutional capacity on climate change mitigation, adaptation, impact reduction and early warning

Indicator: 13.3.1 Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development are mainstreamed in (a) national education policies; (b) curricula; (c) teacher education; and (d) student assessment

Institutional information

Organization(s):

UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UNESCO-UIS)

UNESCO Education Sector, Division for Peace and Sustainable Development, Section of Education for Sustainable Development (UNESCO-ED/PSD/ESD)

Concepts and definitions

Definition:

Indicator 4.7.1/12.8.1/13.3.1 measures the extent to which countries mainstream Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in their education systems. This is an indicator of characteristics of different aspects of education systems: education policies, curricula, teacher training and student assessment as reported by government officials, ideally following consultation with other government ministries, national human rights institutes, the education sector and civil society organizations. It measures what governments intend and not what is implemented in practice in schools and classrooms.

For each of the four components of the indicator (policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment), a number of criteria are measured, which are then combined to give a single score between zero and one for each component. (See methodology section for full details.)

The indicator and its methodology have been reviewed and endorsed by UNESCO's [Technical Cooperation Group on the Indicators for SDG 4-Education 2030 \(TCG\)](#), which is responsible for the development and maintenance of the thematic indicator framework for the follow-up and review of SDG 4. The TCG also has an interest in education-related indicators in other SDGs, including global indicators 12.8.1 and 13.3.1. The TCG is composed of 38 regionally representative experts from UNESCO Member States (nominated by the respective geographic groups of UNESCO), as well as international partners, civil society, and the Co-Chair of the [Education 2030 Steering Committee](#). The [UNESCO Institute for Statistics](#) acts as the Secretariat.

Rationale:

In order to achieve SDG targets 4.7, 12.8 and 13.3, it is necessary for governments to ensure that ESD and GCED and their sub-themes are fully integrated in all aspects of their education systems. Students will not achieve the desired learning outcomes if ESD and GCED have not been identified as priorities in education policies or laws, if curricula do not specifically include the themes and sub-themes of ESD and GCED, and if teachers are not trained to teach these topics across the curriculum.

This indicator aims to give a simple assessment of whether the basic infrastructure exists that would allow countries to deliver quality ESD and GCED to learners, to ensure their populations have adequate

information on sustainable development and lifestyles in harmony with nature. Appropriate education policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment are key aspects of national commitment and effort to implement GCED and ESD effectively and to provide a conducive learning environment.

Each component of the indicator is assessed on a scale of zero to one. The closer to one the value, the better mainstreamed are ESD and GCED in that component. By presenting results separately for each component, governments will be able to identify in which areas more efforts may be needed.

In 1974, UNESCO Member States adopted the *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms*, which encapsulates many of the aims of SDG targets 4.7, 12.8 and 13.3. Every four years countries report on the implementation of the Recommendation. This well-established formal mechanism will be the data source for indicator 4.7.1/12.8.1/13.3.1. The seventh quadrennial reporting round is scheduled to take place in 2020.

Concepts:

Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and *Education for Sustainable Development (ESD)* nurture respect for all, build a sense of belonging to a common humanity, foster responsibility for a shared planet, and help learners become responsible and active global citizens and proactive contributors to a more peaceful, tolerant, inclusive, secure and sustainable world. They aim to empower learners of all ages to face and resolve local and global challenges and to take informed decisions and actions for environmental integrity, economic viability and a just society for present and future generations, while respecting cultural diversity.

Comments and limitations:

The indicator is based on self-reporting by government officials. However, countries will be asked to provide supporting evidence in the form of documents or links (e.g. education policies or laws, curricula, etc.) to back up their responses. In addition, UNESCO will compare responses with available information from alternative sources and, if appropriate, raise queries with national respondents. At the end of the reporting cycle, country responses and the supporting documents will be made publicly available.

Methodology

Computation Method:

Information collected with the questionnaire for monitoring the implementation by UNESCO Member States of the 1974 *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms* will be used for the construction of the global indicator. For each of the four components of the indicator (policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment), a number of criteria are measured, which are then combined to give a single score between zero and one for each component. Only information for primary and secondary education will be used for calculation of indicator 4.7.1/12.8.1/13.3.1.

(a) Laws and policies

The following questions are used to calculate the policies component of the indicator:

A2: Please indicate which GCED and ESD themes are covered in national or sub-national laws, legislation or legal frameworks on education.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) and two levels of government (national and sub-national) = 16 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank the component score is not calculated.

Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if eight of the 16 responses are 'not applicable', the sum of the 0 and 1 scores is divided by 8 to get the mean and not by 16).

A4. Please indicate which GCED and ESD themes are covered in national or sub-national education policies, frameworks or strategic objectives.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

A5. Please indicate whether national or sub-national education policies, frameworks or strategic objectives on education provide a mandate to integrate GCED and ESD.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) and five areas of integration (curricula, learning objectives, textbooks, teacher education, and student assessment) = 10 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if five of the 10 responses are 'not applicable', the sum of the 0 and 1 scores is divided by 5 to get the mean and not by 10).

E1. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (laws and policies) please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed¹ in education laws and policies in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses.

Response categories are not at all = 0, partially = 1, extensively = 2, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = half the simple mean of the 0, 1 and 2 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if one of the two responses is 'not applicable', the sum of the 0, 1 and 2 scores is

¹ GCED and ESD are mainstreamed if they or their themes and sub-themes are mentioned explicitly in relevant documents and are expected to be implemented by the relevant authorities (e.g. Ministries, regional or local education authorities), educational institutions (e.g. schools, colleges and universities), and/or education professionals (e.g. teachers and lecturers), as appropriate.

divided by 2 to get half the mean and not by 4). The score is half the mean in order to ensure it lies between 0 and 1 as do the scores for the other three questions in this section.

Policy component score = simple mean of the scores for questions A2, A4, A5 and E1 (except where the component score should not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank).

(b) Curricula

The following questions are used to calculate the curricula component of the indicator:

B2: Please indicate which GCED and ESD themes are taught as part of the curriculum.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that responses to 'other subjects, please specify' in the question are ignored. If appropriate, during quality assurance answers in this category may be recoded to one of the other 12 subjects.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

B4. Please indicate the approaches used to teach GCED and ESD in primary and secondary education.

There are four teaching approaches (GCED/ESD as separate subjects, cross-curricular, integrated, whole school) = 4 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

E1. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (curricula) please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed² in curricula in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses.

Response categories are not at all = 0, partially = 1, extensively = 2, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = half the simple mean of the 0, 1 and 2 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if one of the two responses is 'not applicable', the sum of the 0, 1 and 2 scores is divided by 2 to get half the mean and not by 4). The score is half the mean in order to ensure it lies between 0 and 1, as do the scores for the other three questions in this section.

² GCED and ESD are mainstreamed if they or their themes and sub-themes are mentioned explicitly in relevant documents and are expected to be implemented by the relevant authorities (e.g. Ministries, regional or local education authorities), educational institutions (e.g. schools, colleges and universities), and/or education professionals (e.g. teachers and lecturers), as appropriate.

Curricula component score = simple mean of the scores for questions B2, B3, B4 and E1 (except where the component score should not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank).

(c) Teacher education

The following questions are used to calculate the teacher education component of the indicator:

C2: Please indicate whether teachers, trainers and educators are trained to teach GCED and ESD during initial or pre-service training and/or through continuing professional development.

There are two types of training (initial/pre-service and continuing professional development) and two types of teachers (of selected subjects in which ESD/GCED are typically taught, and of other subjects) = 4 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

C3. Please indicate on which GCED and ESD themes pre-service or in-service training is available for teachers, trainers and educators.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1 and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

C4. Please indicate whether teachers, trainers and educators are trained to teach the following dimensions of learning in GCED and ESD.

There are four learning dimensions (knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes/behaviours) = 4 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

C5. Please indicate whether teachers, trainers and educators are trained to use the following approaches to teach GCED and ESD in primary and secondary education.

There are four teaching approaches (GCED/ESD as separate subjects, cross-curricular, integrated, whole school) = 4 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1 and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

E1. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (teacher education), please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed³ in teacher education in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses.

Response categories are not at all = 0, partially = 1, extensively = 2, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable (which is ignored). Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = half the simple mean of the 0, 1 and 2 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if one of the two responses is 'not applicable', the sum of the 0, 1 and 2 scores is divided by 2 to get half the mean and not by 4). The score is half the mean in order to ensure it lies between 0 and 1, as do the scores for the other three questions in this section.

Teacher education component score = simple mean of the scores for questions C2, C3, C4, C5 and E1 (except where the component score should not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank).

(d) Student assessment

The following questions are used to calculate the student assessment component of the indicator:

D2: Please indicate whether the GCED and ESD themes below are generally included in student assessments or examinations.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1 and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

D3. Please indicate which of the dimensions of learning in GCED and ESD below are generally included in student assessments or examinations.

There are four learning dimensions (knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes/behaviours) = 4 responses..

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1 and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

³ GCED and ESD are mainstreamed if they or their themes and sub-themes are mentioned explicitly in relevant documents and are expected to be implemented by the relevant authorities (e.g. Ministries, regional or local education authorities), educational institutions (e.g. schools, colleges and universities) and/or education professionals (e.g. teachers and lecturers), as appropriate.

E1. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (student assessment), please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed⁴ in student assessment in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses.

Response categories are not at all = 0, partially = 1, extensively = 2, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = half the simple mean of the 0, 1 and 2 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if one of the two responses is 'not applicable', the sum of the 0, 1 and 2 scores is divided by 2 to get half the mean and not by 4). The score is half the mean in order to ensure it lies between 0 and 1, as do the scores for the other three questions in this section.

Student assessment component score = simple mean of the scores for questions D2, D3 and E1 (except where the component score should not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank).

The component scores all lie between zero and one and are presented as a dashboard of four scores. They are not combined to create a single overall score for the indicator. The higher the score, the more GCED and ESD are mainstreamed in the given component. In this way, users can make a simple assessment in which component area more efforts may be needed.

Disaggregation:

None.

Treatment of missing values:

- **At country level**

A small number of missing values – unknown responses and/or blanks – are treated as zeros in the calculation of the question scores. Where they represent more than 50% of the responses to a single question, the component score is not calculated. In such cases, the component score will be presented as missing when results are disseminated.

- **At regional and global levels**

Regional and global values are not calculated.

Regional aggregates:

Regional aggregates are not calculated.

Sources of discrepancies:

There should be no difference as the indicator values are calculated from the responses submitted by countries. If any changes are proposed to responses as a result of quality assurance procedures, these will be communicated to and verified with countries.

Methods and guidance available to countries for the compilation of the data at the national level:

- Countries wishing to calculate this indicator for themselves should follow the steps described in the 'Computation Method' section above.

⁴ GCED and ESD are mainstreamed if they or their themes and sub-themes are mentioned explicitly in relevant documents and are expected to be implemented by the relevant authorities (e.g. Ministries, regional or local education authorities), educational institutions (e.g. schools, colleges and universities) and/or education professionals (e.g. teachers and lecturers) as appropriate.

- The questionnaire for the monitoring of the implementation of the 1974 *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms* is approved by the Member States of the Executive Board of UNESCO. The questionnaire contains guidelines for completion and a glossary of key terms. In addition, UNESCO provides direct support to Member States in completing the questionnaire and responds to queries in a quality and timely manner.

Quality assurance

- UNESCO will review country responses for consistency and credibility and, if necessary, queries will be raised with national respondents. To assist with this, from 2020, countries will be asked to provide, in addition to completed questionnaires, supporting evidence of their responses in the form of documents or links (e.g. to education policies, laws, curricula, etc.). These will be made publicly available along with completed questionnaires after results are published. UNESCO will also take into account alternative sources of information, where available. These may include national responses to similar intergovernmental consultation processes, such as the Council of Europe's consultations on the [Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education](#), the UN Economic Commission for Europe's consultations on the [Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development](#), or other information on ESD and GCED in countries' national education systems.
- Any proposed changes to response values in the questionnaire as the result of quality assurance procedures will be communicated to and verified with countries by UNESCO. Final results will be shared with countries before publication (i) by UNESCO with the national data providers and (ii) by the UIS with education statistics and SDG indicator focal points as part of its annual SDG indicator verification exercise.

Data Sources

Description:

Responses to the quadrennial reporting by UNESCO Member States on the implementation of the 1974 [Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms](#). The next round of reporting is scheduled to take place in 2020. (See methodology section for details of questions asked.)

Collection process:

Responses are submitted by national governments, typically by officials in Ministries of Education. Respondents are asked to consult widely across other government ministries, with national human rights institutes, the education sector and civil society organizations in compiling their responses. Respondents are also asked to submit supporting evidence in the form of documents or links (e.g. to education policies or laws, curricula, etc.), which will be made publicly available at the end of the reporting cycle.

Responses will be reviewed by UNESCO for consistency and credibility and, if necessary, queries will be raised with national respondents. Where feasible, reference will be made to national documents and links supplied by respondents and to available alternative sources of information.

Any proposed changes in response values in the questionnaire as the result of quality assurance procedures will be communicated and verified with countries by UNESCO. Final results will be shared with countries before publication (i) by UNESCO with the national data providers and (ii) by the UIS with education statistics and SDG indicator focal points as part of its annual SDG indicator verification exercise.

Data Availability

Description:

During the last consultation on the implementation of the 1974 *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms* carried out in 2016, 83 countries provided reports: Central and Southern Asia (6), Eastern and South-Eastern Asia (8), Europe and Northern America (29), Latin America and the Caribbean (14), Northern Africa and Western Asia (10), Oceania (4), and sub-Saharan Africa (12).

Time series:

The first data will be available for 2020. It may be possible to produce estimates for some countries for 2016 but this work has not yet been carried out.

Calendar

Data collection:

Next round in 2020, followed by 2024.

Data release:

Q2 of 2021 (from 2020 reporting round).

Data providers

Requests for reports are submitted to Ministers Responsible for Relations with UNESCO who are typically Education Ministers. Reports are usually completed by government officials in Ministries of Education. Countries are requested to consult widely before submitting their reports. To assist with this, requests for reports are also copied to NGOs in official partnership with UNESCO and to OHCHR. Prior to release of the results, national data providers and national statistical offices are invited to review the results and, if appropriate, raise any concerns.

Data compilers

UNESCO's Sections for Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship and Peace Education.

References

URL: To be provided later when links to the 2020 round of reporting are available.

References: To be provided later when links to the 2020 round of reporting are available.